
Pakistani Educational Leadership Project

Summer Institute At Plymouth State University

Plymouth, NH

2012-13 Evaluation Report

April 2013

Report written by: Judah Leblang, Senior Research Associate
and Gretchen Porter, Research Assistant

Debra Smith, Director



**Program Evaluation and Research Group
at Lesley University**

**Pakistani Educational Leadership
Project**
Summer Institute at Plymouth State University
2012-13 Evaluation Report
April 2013

©2013

Program Evaluation and Research Group

Lesley University
29 Everett Street
Cambridge, MA 02138-2790
617.349.8172

www.lesley.edu/perg.htm
perg@lesley.edu

Table of Contents

Introduction	1
Project Description.....	1
Project Activities.....	2
Evaluation	2
Methodology	2
Evaluation Questions	2
Evaluation Activities	3
Report	3
Findings	4
PELI Alumni Experiences at the Institute.....	4
Participants' expectations	4
Participants' learning at PELI.....	5
PELI Alumni Experiences in Pakistan.....	9
MAP implementation: challenges	9
MAP implementation: areas of success	11
Impact on participants' work	13
Contact with other PELI alumni	14
Participants' suggestions: PELP in Pakistan	15
Faculty and Staff Experiences at PELI	15
Overall planning and implementation	15
Successes and challenges.....	16
MAP implementation	18
Faculty/staff views of participants' experiences at PELI.....	19
Faculty/Staff suggestions.....	21
Discussion and Recommendations:	22
Discussion.....	22
Recommendations	22
Appendix A: Fall 2012 participant interview	II
Appendix B: Winter 2013 participant interview.....	IV
Appendix C: PELI 2012 faculty protocol	VI

Introduction

This report focuses on the Pakistani Educational Leadership Institute (PELI) at Plymouth State University, an annual institute sponsored by the US Department of State, which took place in July 2012. Primary project activities occurred between April 2012 and March 2013. PELI is *one component* of the larger Pakistani Educational Leadership Project (PELP).

Project Description

The Pakistani Educational Leadership Project is funded by the US Department of State, Bureau of Educational and Cultural Affairs through a grant awarded to Plymouth State University. The project has been funded annually since 2003, and approximately 219 individuals have completed the institute since its inception in 2004.

Both PELI and the overall Pakistani Educational Leadership Project are designed to contribute to the growth and development of the educational system in Pakistan, with a particular focus on public-sector/government-run schools, by introducing teacher-trainers, educational administrators and other educational leaders to new methods and ideas. The institute also promotes cross-cultural communication and understanding by bringing Americans and Pakistanis together, “to promote goodwill and understanding between the two countries.” (Project documents)

The goals of the 2012 project, as described in project documents, include the following:

- Strengthen civil society through shared goals in education
- Build vibrant relationships between US and Pakistani citizens
- Build an ethical framework for learning
- Examine critical issues through dynamic interdisciplinary models
- Provide science educators with leadership skills to effect change at the grassroots
- Develop best pedagogical practices that are culturally and geographically appropriate
- Create and sustain a robust community of practice that transcends boundaries

The 2012 summer institute (PELI) was designed to provide professional development training for science educators. Primary areas of focus included discussion of educational leadership, environmental stewardship, and cultural heritage preservation. Participants examined best practices in American education, with an emphasis on hands-on, activity-based learning. The development of critical-thinking, problem-solving and conflict resolution/team building skills was also emphasized at PELI. In addition, the institute was designed to promote cross-cultural and educational exchange both among the Pakistanis and between the Pakistani participants and their American counterparts. During the institute, participants developed a Master Action Plan (MAP), which included specific activities they planned to carry out upon their return to Pakistan.

The project includes the following components: 1) The design and implementation of the four- week institute including pre-departure orientation in Pakistan; 2) Follow-on activities in Pakistan after the institute has been completed; 3) A “Reciprocal Program” in which some PELI alumni and several American educators come together to discuss the project and share ideas, and 4) Formative and summative evaluation of program components.

Project Activities

The project director, who is funded by a grant provided by the US Department of State, oversaw all aspects of the PELP, and worked in conjunction with Hunerkada staff to coordinate the in-country aspects of the program. A major element of the project is the American Reciprocal Program (ARP), which brings together current and some former PELI alumni with a small group of American educators. The most recent ARP took place in March 2013, as this report was being written. According to the project staff, 17 of 19 members of the 2012 cohort attended the three-day session in Islamabad, along with 5 American educators, including the project director.

Evaluation

Methodology

The Program Evaluation and Research Group at Lesley University (PERG) contracted with the project director to evaluate the 2012 institute. The evaluators used a variety of naturalistic methods to collect and triangulate project data. Methods used included interviews with 17 of the 19 alumni (via phone, Skype, or in 3 cases by email) between November 2012 and March 2013, interviews with PELI faculty and staff in fall 2012; focus groups with a subset of male and female participants during the institute, observations by two PERG evaluators at Plymouth, and review of project documents and artifacts.

Note: 11 of 19 respondents completed two interviews each in fall 2012 and winter 2013. The first focused primarily on participants' experiences at PSU, and the second on MAP implementation.

Evaluation Questions

The following questions were developed by the evaluators in consultation with the project director, and based on key project objectives.

- 1) How do current (2012 cohort) participants respond to the institute? What specifically have they learned in terms of both skills and understanding of the institute's primary areas of focus: science education and effective pedagogy; environmental stewardship; educational leadership/ethical decision-making; peace-building, and cultural heritage preservation?
- 2) What impact, if any, has PELI had on participants' pedagogy and practice in working with their own students and colleagues? How, if at all, do they apply this new pedagogical knowledge in their own work?
- 3) How, if at all, has the project promoted cross-cultural understanding and revised perceptions of the US and Americans among PELI participants? How do the Pakistanis view American culture and Americans in general after their experiences at the institute?
- 4) How, if at all, do participants implement their master plans in Pakistan? How successfully (based on project benchmarks) do they carry out their plans, and what challenges/obstacles do they encounter in this process?
- 5) How does project team staff (including the cooperating agency in Pakistan) support the 2012 alumni in implementing their action plans? Do the alumni utilize resources, including alumni from previous institutes, and other available resources in Pakistan?
- 6) What impact, if any, do members of the 2012 cohort have on their home institutions? Do they appear

likely to continue the work and build on their master plans? What aspects of the work appear to be sustainable beyond spring 2012?

Evaluation Activities

Project evaluators completed the following activities over the course of the 2012-13 project year, focusing on participants' experiences at the summer institute and the implementation of their Master Action Plans, as listed below:

- Observed multiple sessions over two-day period at PSU
- Interviewed key PELI faculty and staff
- Interviewed a total of 17 of 19 PELI alumni including several who answered protocol questions via email
- Conducted a focus group at PELI in July 2012 with a representative sample of approximately 8 participants
- Had ongoing contact/frequent phone discussions with the project director at PSU
- Reviewed a sample of Master Action Plans and other project documents, including the project blog and Facebook page

Report

This report focuses on the 2012 institute at Plymouth State University and related project activities, including the Master Action Plans implemented by institute alumni in Pakistan between Fall 2012 and Spring 2013. The report contains the following sections: Introduction; Evaluation; Findings; and Discussion and Recommendations. Following the report is an appendix, which contains the evaluation protocols.

Findings

What was in my mind was that I've learned a lot from Pakistan, I wanted to take something back from here like the different strategies in the classroom, the way the teachers are engaged with the students. Those are the things I wanted to learn from here. I think the schools are totally different from ours. Like experiential studies are more here, it's more activity based, it's not like that in Pakistan.

(PELI participant)

PELI Alumni Experiences at the Institute

The whole trip was so fascinating for me. It was the best opportunity I have ever got in my life. Each and every moment was memorable for me. First of all, this program has changed my attitude. My attitude toward my profession, toward my society, toward my country. It has created a sense of responsibility. I have become more of an informed teacher after this program. I had a great time over there, I learned a lot of things. It was a great addition to my professional development.

(PELI participant)

Participants' expectations

PELI alumni were excited to be part of the institute, and to have the opportunity to learn about pedagogy in the United States. They were particularly interested in learning about student-centered, activity-based learning, which is in contrast to the predominant teacher-centered pedagogy dominant in most Pakistani schools. They were eager to learn and 'make the most' of their limited time at the institute.

Actually, we want to observe the modern pedagogy here. What was going on in your educational system and how do you develop your curriculum. Also I want to enhance my leadership skills. When my principal informed me that there was a program abroad the country and if you want to go you can. And when I saw the modules that were quoted in the advertisement I was impressed and I applied. I hoped to be selected and I was. I came here and observed that we are doing in our schools some activities but here the total system is activity based.

(PELI participant)

My expectation was that I'd go for this training and then I'd learn specific techniques and methodologies related to professional development of teachers. And when I came I reviewed the schedule and found it very comprehensive. The schedule has been designed in such a way that we are having study tours on Tuesday and Wednesday where we get opportunity of experiential learning. Then there are activities as today we have a [class] session. So each and every minute of our time has been planned in a very beautiful manner so it is not wasted. And we are learning day by day a new concept, new activity. It has helped me a lot. Now I have lots of stuff, lots of techniques for the teachers and for the students. Now it depends on me how I localize them and use them for the need of my area. They did a very good job for us.

(PELI participant)

Respondents indicated that they were prepared for the institute due to the pre-departure orientation in Pakistan, and information about the project available on the State Department website, as well as from information provided by alumni of previous institutes.

In my case three of my colleagues had attended this program last year so they were very excited and happy after attending this program and were suggesting that all the colleagues apply....So I applied and after attending I can say it's a good addition to our professional development. The school systems are very developed [in US] but in our schools we have more problems, less opportunities...But in US we have found that all of your students get plenty of opportunity to explore potential and hidden talent and teachers help them to do so. I think we can apply these activities in our school. It is not so difficult to do. So after this program, I will include these activities and programs in my schools and to carry this

message to my teachers. I am so happy that I got this opportunity. (PELI participant)

Participants' learning at PELI

Useful tools and resources

Experiential learning...that was the main thing I learned, they have museums and bring students there and it's used for explaining, and the different institutes [courses], and activity based teaching...and my training [sessions] for teachers is based on these, this is a new concept and in Pakistan we have museums but they are not used for this purpose, and in Pakistan libraries are not used for students. (PELI participant)

Participants appreciated the thought and planning built into the PELI courses by faculty. They noted that most faculty had been teaching in the institute for several years and had developed considerable knowledge of the challenges faced by educators in Pakistan.

It was evident from their lectures. They designed it in a very professional manner, each activity, each content [area]. It's really appreciated. (PELI participant)

Most have been conducting sessions for PELI for more than six years so they have some relevant knowledge. Sometimes, from our group some of the things we told to the teachers are new but most of their information is up to date. (PELI participant)

The first is experiential learning and secondly, activity based teaching. The crux of the whole session [institute] is that. We learned how experiential learning is helpful in making concept clarity. And the activity-based teaching taught us about different types of activities. (PELI participant)

Participants valued the teaching techniques offered by PELI faculty as well as the content knowledge provided in the courses dealing with environmental education and awareness, conflict resolution, and professional development strategies.

One thing is environmental education and conflict resolution. These are the two powerful lessons that we have learned from here. Other than that, a lot of lectures on pedagogy was also useful for us. And different pedagogy techniques, like jigsaw in classroom, and the snowball activity. There were many of them. (PELI participant)

I learned pedagogical techniques, for example professional development design by Doctor Sweeney and conflict resolution by Leo Sandy and environmental education.... These were new areas, especially environmental education and conflict management, the way they organized it for us was excellent. (PELI participant)

In the classes conflict management [was very useful], in the world there is conflict everywhere, especially in my area, how to deal with conflict in the school and dealing with other cultures in society....there was a really big mess here in my area—between families, other villages, other societies, people aren't very educated....This is discrimination, religiously....educating them helps a lot, if someone has another religion, that doesn't mean he doesn't deserve to live.....some people are very hostile toward other people. (PELI participant)

The faculty and MAP instructors also presented no cost/low cost resources, which the participants found useful.

[I learned] how can you teach students in a low cost way, without having a lot of resources, how can you make students understand biology, and I can't just take them out[side], so instead I use research and there are very good resources about plants, animals and ecosystem and they can do their own research and take my laptop and I show it to them and that way I don't spend a lot of money and I can show them what they want. (PELI participant)

They also found both PELI faculty and staff to be encouraging and supportive.

Listening to and sharing our experiences and [PELI faculty were] helpful in every way. Like as teachers we have issues, and you seem to be willing to listen to us and tell us in many ways how we can solve the problems.
(PELI participant)

The Pakistanis also appreciated the opportunity to visit American schools and other sites, including the trip to Washington, DC, and were impressed by the positive attitudes shown by teachers toward their students, as reflected in comments below.

Another thing we noticed yesterday is attitude of the teachers. No matter how rude is a student, teachers are always kind and polite to the students here in America whereas in Pakistan it does not happen. I'm aware...that I need to cool down myself.
(PELI participant)

We visited different museums, monuments and libraries. All were very informative and useful. They were a dream for us. We had a lot of exposure, lot of interaction and a lot of learning from them. We visited Pakistan Embassy about talked about Pakistan-US relationship. We visited very important places like Voice of America, capital building and US Embassy.
(PELI participant)

Participants were somewhat disappointed that they couldn't spend more time in American schools and see more active classrooms due to the academic calendar in the US, as noted below.

Actually, activity based learning was very helpful. The jigsaw activity and all of those activities that we did in classes. To be very honest, if I talk about what is relevant to me, we went to see other classes in different schools, but we couldn't see the teachers teaching or doing activities. Which were unfortunate--because schools are out then. But some activities we observed there we tried also in our school. It was good. We couldn't see the schools there doing the activities in my grade.
(PELI participant)

Several alumni said that the exposure to new ideas and experiences at PELI had increased their confidence as well as impacting their teaching style, as reflected in the following comments.

My experiences at PSU were really informative and were really great. First of all I gained a lot of inner confidence. I was very shy. I learned so many techniques and skills. Even in my studies when I'm giving lectures to my students, automatically I apply them. Now I am quite different teacher. What is quite typical in Pakistan is the teachers are lecturing and the students are passive. Now after coming back from America I am different in all ways, as a person and as a teacher.
(PELI participant)

Participants were impressed by the positive attitude and respect American teachers displayed toward their students, and the friendliness and student-centered approach of PELI faculty, as reflected in the comments below.

They [PELI faculty and staff] were like friends, their attitude was very good, very cooperative and because we are teachers we saw their classroom management was great and they provided experiential learning, their teaching was very good, student centered rather than teacher centered.
(PELI participant)

Cross-cultural understanding

In a lot of communities the people [in Pakistan] don't have positive perceptions about America because it is a developed country and the people are mostly self-centered. So we were afraid of these perceptions of people. But we came here and we saw the people but it was vice-versa. It was totally different for us. The people are very loving and caring. And they respect our culture, respect us. So it is totally different. Now our perceptions have changed. We will tell our people that this is not the way to think.
(PELI participant)

Almost all participants said that their perceptions of Americans had changed for the better. Participants were impressed with the interest and curiosity shown by the people they met, and found Americans generally helpful, considerate, and respectful.

We had a lot of gulfs in our minds because we are coming from an area... You know all the scenario [referring to drone strikes in border areas]. I don't have to say anything. But they [Americans] are the people who are very loving and caring. They care and they respect our culture. Most of our ladies don't like to hand shake with the gents. And in your culture it is considered as bad if someone ignores you, if your men want to shake your hand and our ladies snatches the hand, but they don't feel embarrassment. They respect our culture.
(PELI participant)

Before going to America, definitely my perception was very different about American people. Even in this town, they were talking about America it was not so good, sometimes. But it's different after PSU because I talk about the experiences where I met with American people that I saw recently. So I try to clear it up that is not the situation that you people are thinking about Americans are bad and they're different... because there is a movie story right now, the movie from America, the anti- Muslim movie. And the people they were really angry. Obviously this is a very sensitive area. They say Americans very bad and that's why they made this kind of movie and this and that. So I told them I was there and I know them and I was quite satisfied that that is not what the American people think about the Muslim people.
(PELI participant)

Participants frequently commented on the importance of time and punctuality in American culture, freedom of expression, and Americans' dedication to their work. They also commented on the relative equality/sense of respect that was afforded to those of all backgrounds.

But the big thing that we had is that you're free to say whatever you like. And you feel free to act the way you want. And if you don't like anything just say it, nobody will mind. If you don't like shaking hands, just say it to the person. And the other thing was, you people are so punctual. 12:00 means 12, not 12:01.
(PELI participant)

There was a discipline of time, accurate time. They would give us the exact time to meet. To go on any visit, when we went to Philip Academy, have to be there on time.
(PELI participant)

One very important thing that I noted here in America that I really like. If it is adopted for the world the world will become just like heaven. The Americans, wherever we went, nobody considered us as a Muslim, as a Christian, as a Hindu, as a man or woman. They were treating us all equally. American people are humanity. If this value is modeled throughout the world, many of the issues would be settled automatically.
(PELI participant)

The Pakistanis were impressed with Americans' sense of respect for those from other cultures. They said this respect and tolerance was something we would bring back to Pakistan, and share with their communities.

The [American] people are pure hearted; they don't have their hatred for the people. For us, like we are belonging to 19 communities [in Pakistan], different communities so it's our duty to go back and interact with the people, tell the people about the culture. And what's the difference in it, what's so good and bad. In both societies you have good things and bad things. No one is perfect and nowhere is perfect. So it's our duty to change. It can go on and on, I'll discuss with one person, and discuss with another person and so on like that.
(PELI participant)

They also discussed the learning that occurred within their own diverse group, which represented far-flung regions of Pakistan such as Balochistan and KPK, and the various cultures and languages represented within the 2012 cohort.

I had never heard Balochi before I came here and when I came here I came to know that there are so many languages in my own country that I cannot speak. And we are learning about our culture and we are also learning about your culture. That is inter- and intra--both cultures are being understood here. This is a good learning as well as fun. (PELI participant)

Finally, PELI provided the Pakistanis with an opportunity to share their cultures with Americans at various events, including the Cultural Night at the end of the institute.

I want to mention that I remember my last program, we celebrated cultural night at PSU. Our Pakistani brothers came and they invited us for this program. It was during Ramadan and we are fasting. So we celebrate our cultural night over there. On multimedia we show our cultural songs, our culture, our history, with every influence that is in the culture we see on multimedia. It was a good experience. (PELI participant)

Suggestions: The PELI experience

Members of the 2012 PELI cohort offered a range of suggestions related to their experiences at PSU. These included the following:

- Increase the duration of the institute
- Provide more breaks and free time in the evenings

There was a rush over there, we had no time to sit, we were just moving, moving....the training sessions, there should be some relaxation time in the evening, like after 7, 9:30 is very late. Second is this institute should keep on going, the nominations were taken, it was a very good thing, not privileged ones, [acceptance was based on merit] so this should continue, it is a good idea.....I don't see other changes. It's a good combination of learning and cultural exchange. (PELI participant)

- Improve pre-departure orientation, provide more background about American culture

I think it would be better if you could give Pakistanis a little more orientation about queues and standing in line, more orientation to American culture...it's embarrassing that 19 or 20 adults are not minding the queue or being on time....it's an insult in American culture, if Pakistanis are taught more about American culture, it makes it easier for [dorm staff].....this should be done by Americans rather than Pakistanis. (PELI participant)

I think the pre-departure orientation should be hosted by PELI alumni. There is an alumni there that was [a PELI participant] from two years ago and the things he told us were really helpful. We didn't realize it at the time but once we went to Plymouth we realized it was good advice. And pre-departure information, I think even before, we weren't informed about many valuable things. Like many people didn't bring dresses for cultural night. Because by the time anyone told them we were packed and in Islamabad. A lot of information we didn't get until we were there.

(PELI participant)

- Include additional topics such as project-based learning and assessment
- Consider broadening the MAPs to allow for more than one area of focus or topic

I think the MAP was too limited. We learned so many things and when designing the MAP we were told to focus only on one thing. I took the professional development [course] and went for activity-based learning but MAP should include multiple tasks. (PELI participant)

- Provide more feedback about strengths and weaknesses of the individual MAPs at PSU—provide constructive criticism
- Invite American teachers to come and speak to the group

- Schedule the institute when schools are in session

It is good that we are visiting schools. But the thing which is missing is that we are not seeing the total environment over there. Like Philips Academy, and the other school [we visited], they were having their remedial classes. I just wondered there must be a whole school going on and we could just visit them and sit at the back and observe the whole classroom and environment. That would be more helpful to us.
(PELI participant)

Several respondents said they were very satisfied with their experiences at PELI and would not change anything.

No. Everything was perfect. There was no problem. Everyone was very cooperative. We enjoyed them all.
(PELI participant)

PELI Alumni Experiences in Pakistan

MAP implementation: challenges

Upon their return to Pakistan, members of the 2012 cohort focused on refining and implementing their Master Action Plans. They were anxious to apply the teaching approaches and resources obtained at PELI; however, the alumni were unable to get their initial “seed money” for several months after returning from the US, which, (for some but not all), delayed the implementation of their MAPs.

I'm anxiously waiting for that [payment] so I can buy 10 computers, how can I give them [students] a demonstration without computers. I have bought some charts, books, and handouts from my salary and some printouts from the internet...
(PELI participant)

My MAP is actually about resource development, which is nothing new. I've been doing it for last five years, still I'm continuing it. I am sharing some sessions with my colleagues on the importance of resource development in early childhood. I have almost done half of my MAP but still we have not received the grant for our MAP so I couldn't purchase the resources. But I have arranged for sessions with my teachers... Problem is we haven't received funding. Didn't inform us why it was late. We called them a month before but from Islamabad office [Hunerkada] they say they will inform us whenever they receive it from US.
(PELI participant)

Note: Participants did eventually receive their seed money through Hunerkada, and used it to implement their MAPs.

Several alumni reported that their supervisors/administrators, and in some cases, their colleagues, were not supportive of their MAPs, and some had to adjust their plans accordingly.

This is a private school, not government funded, the pay is low, and the principal does not agree with my MAP....my MAP is about communicating in English...and my students are not used to participating...The problem with my students is they're taught English as a subject not as a language, it's total memorization not learning, and then they have a problem with the book...they do read English but they don't understand the textbook and the only English they know is the standard textbook.
(PELI participant)

Others identified the challenges of promoting change within a system that emphasizes rote learning, memorization and exams, as noted below.

The Pakistani educational system is not dynamic, it's very static. Teachers are provided with fixed syllabus and exams based only on that...so many holidays and so much time off the teachers are

always rushing to finish syllabi and get students to pass exams but this is not quality education...so we need activity based activities, I think the American educational system is good, they promote critical thinking about here it's just exams...I'm trying my best to bring something in and the students enjoy it, but students are afraid because they have to take exams and memorize everything...we are trying to bring some changes. I have been able to bring 20% of change to science teachers...we continue to focus on change, [I hope we] can increase it to 50%. (PELI participant)

Well, the most challenging thing is our system, our educational system requires students to memorize content, so our teachers can't do anything apart from that because it requires students to memorize things. System is based on rote memorization, that is the biggest flaw, it's difficult to do activities based learning in this system but it's painful for the students...so the teachers are in the habit of doing everything in lecture. (PELI participant)

Some of the female teachers faced additional challenges, based on traditional views of women's/girls' roles in Pakistani society, as well as issues of security as noted below.

I started my MAP. My topic was about environmental education [for my] students and my school area....I needed videos and images to show students....I was supposed to take pictures and showing video—it's totally different [in Pakistan vs. in Plymouth], one time I made a video of girls in the school the parents complained and they went to my principal....fear of the Taliban and that she would share this information with another organization. So I wasn't able to do anymore. There is no security, it's a disgusting situation.

Despite the challenges faced by the teacher quoted above, she did talk with her students about cleaning and improving their school environment, though she was not able to implement other aspects of her MAP, such as field trips.

I gave short lectures to my students...I have up to 200 students per class but I could create awareness among students through lecture method, but I couldn't do field trips. (PELI participant)

Last time I discussed challenges I'm facing, the most challenge is the people in the community were not cooperating with me but I met with people in community because they don't allow their daughters to go out[side]. (PELI participant)

Logistics and support

Several PELI 2012 alumni expressed frustration, as noted above, at a perceived lack of support from Hunerkada, the cooperating agency in Pakistan. MAP timelines were often delayed due to difficulty in getting the seed money, and some alumni said that, while they appreciated the support provided by the project director and the graduate assistant/MAP liaison at PSU, they needed more guidance from professionals located within Pakistan.

It should be noted that several respondents had very limited internet access, and therefore had limited contact with PELI faculty, project staff, or fellow members of the 2012 cohort. These individuals were in remote areas, where additional support would have been helpful.

[I have] no internet access.....I don't use the blog or Facebook because there is no internet. (PELI participant)

A majority of alumni who attended the mid-MAP meeting in Islamabad in October 2012 (either in person or via Skype) said that the meeting was useful in terms of getting feedback on their MAPs and sharing ideas with their colleagues. (The project director was planning to participate via Skype but could not join the discussion due to connectivity issues).

It was useful but could have been better because there was no one from our network, just one senior student [alumni] who guided us, there was no one from Plymouth, Madame Blake or Kathleen there was no one to guide us, they were not on Skype, I don't know why they weren't on line or come to Pakistan, that would have been to our betterment.
(PELI participant)

One PELI alumnus from an earlier cohort did provide feedback to attendees at the mid-MAP meeting in October 2012, and also offered some tips on the PELI blog. Most found his comments helpful. However, several respondents wanted additional support and direction.

Approximately 11 participants attended the mid-MAP meeting in Islamabad, including several via Skype. A few said that the meeting was not especially helpful. Several were frustrated by the logistical challenges of traveling to Islamabad and dealing with Hunerkada staff. However, 17 of the 19 participants took part in the American Reciprocal Program in Islamabad in March 2013, along with the project director and 4 other American educators, which provided members of the 2012 cohort with an opportunity to report on their action plans and share experiences with their colleagues.

MAP implementation: areas of success

They [my colleagues] cooperated with me completely. For the complete four days I focused on training and they supported me completely to execute this [my action plan] and asked me if I needed support, nice teamwork, I got support from PSU and my colleagues here and the teachers [trainees] were so conscious of learning, and I'm so happy and planning to conduct more sessions on these topics...these were Lahore teachers but I have 26 districts, I have to conduct these everywhere. I told these teachers I will pick trainers from these teachers.
(PELI participant)

As of the writing of this report, the alumni had received their initial payments, and most were actively engaged in completing, (or had completed) their MAPs. Several respondents said that they had focused their MAPs on their own students, because of the obstacles they had encountered in attempting to do a broader implementation. They did emphasize the positive impact of their MAPs on their students and on their teaching.

My MAP has finished, but it has really worked out good. The students improved a lot. First part was that they should read and write properly and understand meaning in a book, they had difficulty understanding the meaning of words according to the context, words are not always used in the way of the dictionary....and they've used their comprehension, their vocabulary, and they're more interested in learning English, it keeps them interested most of the time. The first time they studied for 4 hours non-stop, they didn't want to stop....we used Harry Potter, they were talking about characters and what they mean...
(PELI participant)

Others found their colleagues to be supportive, and their [teacher] trainees very interested in learning new approaches to pedagogy, computer skills and other valuable information.

I completed my MAP my training sessions, which consisted of 5 days of training. It was awesome to train my colleagues... And my training [included computer software and]...cultural exchange, and then lecture, then a break and then a two hour session in the labs....actually, we also got winter holidays in December and I utilized those holidays, the principal made them available for the training session. They were very eager, I interviewed some of them after and they said they needed this training...30 teachers from my own school and 10 teachers from the other two schools. Actually it was 43 total, because 3 other teachers asked me.
(PELI participant)

My action plan was divided in two parts, the first part was to deliver plans to target teachers and then identify the changed methods [used in their teaching] and how students are changing and what types of response from students and parents...I have completed the first portion, working with teachers of two schools. Then teachers have to teach an activity to the students... I hope to do this [series of

observations] in March/ April...with 25 teachers in three schools...These teachers are teaching a total of about 800 students.
(PELI participant)

Yes the district officer has supported me, this is a government organization, and they have helped me...he gave me permission for this MAP and I got permission to contact other school principals to do the training [for teachers, focused on using technology].
(PELI participant)

Several respondents planned to continue and/or expand their action plans, as described below.

As was scheduled I conducted trainings sessions with teachers in Lahore district, it was a good experience for me and for the teachers, I tried to convey what I learned to the teachers. Training is done, follow up activities are going on. In the next week I'll be going to south of Punjab, I'll be doing training--not full days but I will share some things [activities] with them.....it was in my plan.
(PELI participant)

Yes, because I'm doing it in three schools....because of limited seed money, but as I told you other people are sending me requests—administrators and teachers really want to change and the private sector is very interested in changing teacher styles. I'm hoping I will be able to expand my MAP...This is a start, not an end, this is the start of a trend, no matter if I train 30 teachers [or more] this is something good, even if I finish my MAP, I will go to other places public or not public [schools], I will share my learning with their staff.
(PELI participant)

I have taken the other grades in the pipeline, other classes, like 8th grade will be jumping to 9th grade, so I will continue this [MAP] for a long time, and I plan in the future they will also learn computers, it will be added to their courses, that is my future plan for the remaining students in the other grades—it will be for next year and following years, I am hoping for that.
(PELI participant)

Respondents with limited community and/or institutional support still attempted to implement their MAPs; for example, one of the teachers quoted in the 'Challenges' section met with parents of her female students and convinced them to allow their daughters to participate in some field trips and outdoor activities.

I'm working with my students but [parents] they didn't allow their daughters to do outdoor activities but I succeeded in convincing them. I had a field trip with my students a week ago...this was a cultural show, it was a cultural exchange program about a one and a half hour drive from my school...they [students] were very happy, they enjoyed it a lot, and they participated in different activities.
(PELI participant)

One teacher had offered workshops on improving hygiene in the school community. She had trained teachers and students, and had invited mothers of the students to attend special workshops, as described below:

My action plan was on helping hygiene in the community because the concept of health was very poor and many people are not educated, so I focused on health and hygiene and the environment of the school. I conducted a three-day workshop, trained them [teachers] in hygiene and they really enjoyed it and said it was useful for them, so that teachers could guide their students...I had two sessions with the mothers....I'm doing it grade by grade, I don't want to stop the process, I've completed two groups, I want to do the whole school [mothers], a session on health and hygiene and how to keep their kids clean and how to properly wash your hands.
(PELI participant)

Another respondent said the principal was not supportive, but colleagues and community members enabled the teacher to purchase computers and implement the MAP with students.

He [the principal] feels 'it's your job, don't interfere in my work' but other staff members have

supported me and some people in the community [have also been helpful]. School community people gave me a seed grant, this is a community school, the landlord and some good people gave me funds.
(PELI participant)

Impact on participants' work

I just did lecture method before going to America and now I use both methods, lecture with experiential method. I use more practical [hands on methods] also.
(PELI participant)

In addition to and in conjunction with their MAPs, alumni said that their experiences at PELI had strongly influenced their teaching and the way they interacted with students and colleagues.

In Pakistan we deliver only lectures so students are not fully engaged with us....we don't use activities, and students' qualities are not brought out. At Plymouth State I learned to use activities so students can engage with me, and they are more interested in their studies, and applying what I learned in Plymouth, students are more interested.
(PELI participant)

Participants said they had made major changes in their teaching practices, and focused more on activity-based teaching and student-centered learning, rather than lecture, as reflected in the comments below.

The main thing that has changed in me is I'm more friendly to students, we talk about other things than just education, I ask them how they feel today....The other teachers teach the way I was taught in school [by lecture], I'm glad I changed. I'm more happy with my change than I was before PELI.
(PELI participant)

Before Plymouth it was a teacher-centered classroom but now I feel my lecture is a student-centered classroom. When I was in my class, I asked Leo Sandy [professor at PSU], I asked him the main difference between the Pakistani and the American classroom, he said in the American classroom the student speaks more than the teacher, and in my classroom I involve my students in different activities, it isn't just lecture.
(PELI participant)

I firmly believe there is change in my teaching style, my talking style, delivery, I have learned many things. When I go to a classroom to teach, I find some ways to deliver things in an interactive way instead of just lecturing to students, my teaching style and my personality and perceptions have changed, and the way I interact with students and teachers and I'm trying my best to deliver this to them [share the changes with them]. I am doing it and I will continue it.
(PELI participant)

Several respondents said they had increased their confidence, leadership abilities and/or sense of professionalism through PELI.

Definitely it [teaching approach] changed. Before when we taught we didn't think much about it. We were not very cautious about our approach. Now that I know that I have to tell Madam Blake, and others in Islamabad about it we are very cautious about what we were doing. I get feedback from my students. I make soft copies so that whenever they need it I can send to them. I ask my teachers [for feedback] and make corrections and I get their help. Whatever can be improved in my expertise, so that I can give you and Madam Blake and others good feedback. Now I'm very conscious about what I'm doing. That is I think a big thing.
(PELI participant)

I find a change in my personality. I have got a lot of knowledge, a lot of skills. (PELI participant)

My experiences at PSU were really informative and were really great. First of all I gained a lot of inner confidence. I was very shy. I learned so many techniques and skills. Even in my studies when I'm giving lectures to my students, automatically I apply them. Now I am quite different teacher. What is quite typical in Pakistan is the teachers are lecturing and the students are passive. Now after coming

back from America I am different in all ways, as a person and as a teacher.

(PELI participant)

PELI alumni also described an increased sense of pride in their work, and a desire to share their newfound knowledge with their students and/or their colleagues.

After PSU I came back to my country, I am a completely different person, what I was taught at Plymouth, it changed my teacher learning process, my commitment and how I inspire students and how I teach them, I'm really thankful to you people for giving this to me and changing my professionalism, and for my community and my students as well.

(PELI participant)

The teacher quoted above, when asked to give a specific example of how his teaching had changed, described how he engaged students in taking responsibility for their school environment, and helping them learn via activities.

Let me tell you one thing. We were playing cricket at school, the ground was totally dirty and barren, students had no chance to clean it, and our school garden was destroyed...I decided to take my students to the garden and make them realize this is part of our school, if our environment is clean, that's our future. And in my class, Pakistani teachers only lecture but I take my students to garden and other places to make them realize that what I'm teaching is important for them, I focus on activity based teaching, according to the subject and topic.

(PELI participant)

One teacher cited above made significant changes to her school environment, such as developing a school garden and eliminating the burning of garbage on school grounds.

I also had a project with kids grades 6-8 and we grew plants from pods and made a green area near the school and they will take care of it all year, we don't have a proper gardener, no one to take care of school grounds so we started a group of kids who will take care of the school garden, and they will take care of that, and we have a group of teachers and the principal who will help. Also there is an area in back of the school, we used to burn garbage and have debates with the school about the smoke, it wasn't healthy. We closed the pit and now we put it in proper garbage bags and we worked with the garbage authority, they take it away.

(PELI participant)

Contact with other PELI alumni

Most of the alumni said that they were in contact with other members of their cohort. Some had become active in other networks, such as the US Department of State alumni, and a few said they had been offered other professional development opportunities after their experiences at PELI.

Yes, we have an open group on Facebook...we have 2012 group, and we have the PELI page and the US alumni [State Department] network and I'm in contact with all of them and I've been in contact with other PELI through SMS and phone as well.

(PELI participant)

Yes I am in touch with the alumni of my group, most of them. There are some cultural problems in Pakistan, there are some areas where females are not allowed with males so I don't have contact with those females but I have contact with about 15 people, we write to each other and comment on each other's comments and ideas.

(PELI participant)

Several other alumni, primarily those in remote areas, lacked internet access and had very limited contact with fellow members of their cohort.

[I have limited contact] by text, not on Facebook because we don't have good internet, sometimes phone

calls.

(PELI participant)

Participants' suggestions: PELP in Pakistan

In addition to suggestions specifically related to the institute, some alumni wanted more in-country support. They appreciated email/on line feedback from project staff, including the project director and the liaison at PSU, but wanted more assistance in Pakistan. Several expressed frustration and dissatisfaction with the cooperating agency in Pakistan, in terms of logistics for the mid-MAP session, and in obtaining the seed money for their action plans in a timely manner.

- Provide more in-country support
- Make logistics run more smoothly, consider another cooperating agency in Pakistan
- Provide more resources and distribute them in a timely manner
- Provide opportunities for on line courses or additional learning opportunities in Pakistan

Faculty and Staff Experiences at PELI

I think this is a hugely valuable program and I certainly hope this project continues to be funded because they [Pakistani educators] really are in need of our help.

(PELI staff)

Overall planning and implementation

PERG evaluators interviewed a total of 10 faculty and staff, including 2 cultural liaisons/dorm staff, and the project director. (For the purposes of this report, all respondents in this category will be identified, when quoted, as PELI staff). All our respondents had been involved with previous institutes and had between two and nine years of experience working within the project. Though the number of participants decreased from 40 in 2010 and 2011 to 19 in 2012, the institute requires a great amount of planning, coordination and cooperation among various individuals and departments both within and beyond PSU, as has been documented in previous reports.

Each [institute] contains different variables, and [this year] we dropped from 40 to 19 [participants]. I'd say overall...things went relatively well considering the tight schedule and tight funding. The Pakistani participants didn't really have much orientation before they came over, they had received no information about us, and we had no information about them, so everyone in the institute threw themselves in.

(PELI staff)

Data show that participating faculty and staff value their experiences working with the Pakistanis, and believe that the program is valuable both for the content conveyed and for the intercultural exchange promoted through PELI.

As in previous institutes, the project director coordinated the various components of the institute and worked to ensure everyone was 'on the same page' in terms of facilitating the Pakistanis' learning at the institute. Respondents generally said that the institute went well, and that the Pakistani participants benefited from their experiences at PSU.

We [PELI faculty/ staff] collaborated with others. Had a few meetings with some of the others, like conflict resolution and educational leadership [faculty]. We talked a little bit with them just so they understood where we were coming from. That could probably be improved a little bit more. But I think everybody was trying to get in what they thought was important in the small amount of time they had

and it's hard to please everyone.

(PELI staff)

We had two or three meetings in the spring and summer. We talked about who was doing what and what's working well. I think it went very smoothly. Everyone who is in it [taught at PELI] has done it before, so we're always tweaking things... I think the planning is good. The people that are in charge of it, there's 2 or 3 young women there, they're very competent. It's gone well. At this point it almost plans itself. Sometimes I may have been left out of the communication loop on a couple of occasions. Like I didn't know when culture night was because I didn't get that information so I wasn't able to attend.

(PELI staff)

Several components of PELI have been refined over time, and faculty/staff continued to adjust their courses and activities, based on the goals and areas of focus of each year's institute. This is particularly true of the environmental sessions, which have been a key component of the institute for many years.

We actually spent quite a bit of time [tailoring the course content for the Pakistanis] and in fact I just completed my master's thesis that was on water resources in Pakistan. So this is very personal for me.

(PELI staff)

The environmental theme, which runs through the institute, has been developed in response to important issues of watershed management and the recognition of the role of water as a crucial resource in South Asia, as reflected in the following comments.

We specifically were mindful of the fact that the Indus watershed is their primary watershed. So we familiarized ourselves with the geography and the sources of irrigation, the canals, the history of their water resources in the country, the reservoirs, the need for improving infrastructure. All those things I researched so that we could take a look at, depending on the areas where they were, if they were in the tribal area or more urban areas, being able to present them with activities that they could do with students, using minimal or inexpensive resources because they don't have a lot of them. (PELI staff)

One instructor increased her focus on providing practical information to the Pakistanis and described how she tailored course content for use in participants' action plans.

Basically I was trying to connect with their master plan in my course, it was important for them to create a plan they could actually deliver, I tried to focus on aspects of professional development they could deliver in their MAP plans. I did attend one MAP session and worked with individuals on applying ideas into their plan....I was hopeful much of what we did in our class would be applicable to their plan, less focus on the content area and more on skills they'd need when they got home.

Was this a change? It was an adjustment, working last year with the MAP team, I realized it was important to make it applicable--a more conscious way of making those connections. (PELI staff)

Successes and challenges

Successes

Despite a very compressed timeframe for the institute, PELI faculty were generally pleased with the Pakistanis' engagement and participation in the various sessions. (It should be noted that all the Pakistani participants described their experiences at PELI in positive terms and said they benefited both personally and professionally from the institute). The institute provided a range of activities, including field trips to historic and cultural sites, and the trip to Washington, DC, which was cited as a highlight by many of the PELI alumni. The two faculty responsible for the environmental coursework worked closely together, and wove in numerous examples from Pakistan, based on their research and experience working with previous groups. They also solicited ongoing feedback from participants through guiding questions and journals, as explained below.

We have journals we provide for our part with guiding questions. So each day we have an activity, whether it's a field excursion or we do or we have hands-on activities where we have these guiding questions to get them to parallel the activities that they did here and think about how they can model that back in PK. So these questions are to help them make connections and they write them in journals that we provide for them. Then we look through the journals and they all really provided a lot of feedback. That was wonderful; they were definitely interested. (PELI staff)

Finally, the MAP instructors reported that participants were very engaged and motivated in creating their MAPs. (An in-depth discussion of the action plans is included below).

Challenges

Several staff members cited the integration of the MAPs and technology leading up to the institute as a challenging area. PELI staff were planning to use Voicethread software, which they regarded as user-friendly and optimal for participants to post master plans and other related documentation. However, the PSU administration determined that the software could not be used shortly before the Pakistanis' arrival, and a blog was set up for participant use instead. Staff reported that the blog was adequate, but not ideal, for the Pakistanis' use, and that the process of setting up the blog before and during the institute was somewhat frustrating. While participants did post their MAPs on the blog, they have been using it to a very limited extent since the fall of 2012.

Faculty and staff also cited compressed schedule and time constraints, due to the very limited funding of this year's institute. Several said that the time allotted for their courses had been decreased, which made planning somewhat difficult. Some field trips and activities provided in previous institutes were changed or cut due to funding constraints.

Faculty and staff noted that the institute was more compressed this year, which required them to eliminate some activities and reduce the amount of material covered in their courses.

I had three sessions with them—two days but three sessions, really a short time. They were engaged, involved and interested once we started. For next year I will ask for a little more time....They did a great job of jigsawing and discussed the four roles but I would have liked quick presentations practicing the four roles [from each group]....presenter, facilitator, coach and designer...it's hard for them to realize one person has to take on all those roles...then they can look at each others' groups and observe how they practiced the skills, I would like to have time for them to do that with me. My vision is that they have incorporated this into their MAPs and that they think about these 4 roles when they deliver the MAPs. (PELI staff)

Several faculty said they would have liked to be more involved in the MAPs sessions and/or other activities, but were constrained by other commitments. Another challenge involved bringing the various faculty and MAP instructors together before the institute, so all were aware of their various goals and objectives, and to facilitate the integration of the MAPs into the overall institute. Staff reported that one or two meetings of the full group did take place, but that these meetings were less frequent than in previous years. (It should be noted that some faculty and staff work outside of PSU and are not readily available outside of the summer months).

Time...is an issue, it's difficult to schedule everything and all the activities. I'd like to be able to spend more time with them [participants] and for me it was difficult—not setting aside to spend time in evenings to spend in MAP sessions, I need to do that. I would love some planning ahead of time so faculty could work with people doing MAP planning and find a way to support students. It's a huge time constraint, [hard to] get people together during summer or before summer...the integration of the

courses in the MAP is always a challenge....

(PELI staff)

I wasn't able to go to all of them [PELI planning meetings] because I'm half time now. I live 110 miles away now. I think I've been sufficiently involved given my particular role, I don't have a lot to do with some of the other things, the science stuff, environmental. From my niche, I think I'm ok.

(PELI staff)

One faculty member expressed some frustration about the physical space [room] in which the course took place, which was not conducive to interactive group activities.

I didn't need an auditorium because we only had 20 people. For 40 people last time it was fine. But I don't think the auditorium lent itself to much intimacy. It's just not the same as if you're in a room. I could have easily used the classroom; I don't know why they gave me an auditorium. Any classroom would have been better. Movable desks and chairs would have been easier, and better to have sunlight. It wasn't very conducive to a positive atmosphere. I think the room thing is important.

(PELI staff)

In addition to the teaching staff, two “cultural liaisons” assisted the Pakistanis in the dorm and on various field trips, and with personal issues and concerns. The liaisons enjoyed working with the 2012 group, though they faced several challenges, including interpersonal tension/conflict among some group members, and the illness of one participant, who was hospitalized for several days. In addition, the participants were initially not pleased with the food offered in the PSU dining hall, but after meeting with the dining hall management, accommodations were made and the situation was resolved.

We had someone with malaria, I spent till 3 or 4 am at the hospital, this kept happening for a week and finally he was admitted, it was too much, he kept getting sick and since he was a male, it was my responsibility to take him and have him picked up, and I stayed with him, that was not what I expected.

(PELI staff)

MAP implementation

I want to emphasize we had some challenges but we flexed and we did the job...communication and planning is the key...overall this was a fantastic year and I liked the fresh take on who these people are, [posting participant bios and information on the blog], that's the message to the State Department, I was happy with the outcome and hope we can continue and refine this next year.

(PELI staff)

The MAP instructors continued to work together to assist participants in developing their action plans. They reported that the Pakistanis focused on developing plans that were practical and achievable with limited resources. (Due to the compressed timeline of the institute and other factors, a decision was made to simplify the action plans, and keep a primary focus on developing practical, achievable plans).

The two MAP instructors have worked together for several years. They have developed considerable knowledge about the educational system and related context of Pakistan and of some of the challenges the Pakistani educators face in their schools and educational institutions.

I thought the MAPs went really well, it was very different from the past. This was the way we were guided [by the project director] to do it, we focused more on telling the participants' stories. We used a blog to do that.

(PELI staff)

The staff member quoted above emphasized the practical nature of participants' MAPs; many were less ambitious or broad than the MAPs developed by previous PELI alumni, but focused on realistic objectives tailored to their particular circumstances in Pakistan.

... They were paired down, most were simple, and I think they would be very successfully implemented in Pakistan. They weren't very extravagant, but really focused on their actual schools, students, and classrooms. Not so much on teacher training and things like that. There were a few of those still, but most focused specifically on their students. (PELI staff)

MAP instructors also wanted a bit more time to provide additional feedback and allow the Pakistanis to meet in small groups by region, as they had done in previous years.

We did, that was in the beginning, we asked them about challenges and we talked about SMART [goals] but we didn't have time to do an accountability check with their colleagues, we didn't have time for small group breakout sessions. (PELI staff)

Project staff also gave participants cameras and other resources, so that PELI alumni could document their MAP implementation, as noted in the comments below.

We also were doing a technology survey, to find out what are their needs, and they all left with digital cameras and USB sticks so they could document their projects, and to understand the power structure and resources back home. If you're going to try to implement change in a district, what would that look like, there was more of an effort to track that. (PELI staff)

The MAPs instructors viewed their sessions as an opportunity for the Pakistanis to integrate their learning at PELI into their action plans, as reflected in the comments below.

Our class [MAP sessions] was where they take everything they learn from PELI, from their other courses, and put it together to create what they want to do in Pakistan. And it's basically 100% their work and initiative. We give them a guide and they fill in the blanks basically and it's very creative and labor intensive. I think at first they're all a little bit confused and asking what to do but that didn't stop them. So they asked a lot of questions. They put a lot of initiative into completing their plans, in revising, in having us look at their work, is it professional looking. I think they were very self-sufficient and excited by the work they were doing in our class. (PELI staff)

Finally, the MAP instructors said that having faculty present for a formal presentation of participants' action plans would be helpful, and a key sign of respect for the Pakistanis.

On the second half of boot camp day they [Pakistanis] showcased their work. It would have been nice to have a different venue and have professors there, that's important in their [Pakistani] culture, it's about pride and respect. They're presenting to us but it would have been nice to have a podium and an audience, the whole nine yards like years past. (PELI staff)

Faculty/staff views of participants' experiences at PELI

PELI staff reported that members of the 2012 PELI cohort were motivated, interested in learning, and highly engaged in the institute courses and related activities. Though several staff noted that there were cliques within the group and tension among some participants, faculty reported that participants were engaged and took initiative in PELI classes, and that they were primarily focused on learning.

Participants' learning

We just have them be very clear about what they have available, sometimes very few resources, you work with what you have and we give them strategies and ideas of what they can do to accomplish [their goals], and some of their goals are very simple and that's OK and some are more lofty, we work with what they have. (PELI staff)

As noted above, all PELI faculty and staff had participated in previous institutes. In their courses, faculty primarily used observation and discussion to gauge participants' learning. In the environmental

course, the Pakistanis were asked to reflect on key guiding questions, which were reviewed by faculty, and to develop a lesson plan.

We provide them with guiding questions in the journal for each day that they're with us, and then we collect journals and read through and see if they're following our environmental thread throughout. And then on the final day they had a final project that they had to do which was based on all the material that was covered with us and they had to use those materials and transform it into an activity, or lesson plan, that they would do in their communities back in Pakistan that was relevant to their region. It worked out really well; they had some fabulous ideas, and some great work, which I have.

(PELI staff)

As noted earlier in this report, faculty were somewhat constrained by the PELI schedule, which impacted the degree of assessment some incorporated into their courses.

I didn't do as much [assessment] as last year. I got lost in the exchange. We were so busy doing things in the classroom that sometimes I never got to that. There was one thing I did do, I had them fill out something about: can they use this at home, what would prevent them from using it, what obstacles do they see, and how can they overcome them? We did some of that. But I didn't assess each session.... I just didn't feel any pressure to do a lot of that. I spent more time doing exercises and doing discussion. I see them acting and talking, you hear what they say, hear their examples and questions.

(PELI staff)

That's [assessment is] another issue, I met with each of them in groups of 4, I had them share with me, I'd sit in on their groups and ask them to tell me more, it was a very subjective assessment...a whole afternoon we did that and I could readjust based on what I was hearing and we shared out in terms of professional development delivery, I heard the important pieces shared back in the large group, that's as far as we could go.

(PELI staff)

The MAPs instructors provided participants with guidelines for development of their MAPs, and they assessed participants' learning based on their blog posts and the practicality of their plans.

We assessed their learning through the blog, what they wrote. It was really a storytelling blog, if they accomplished what we asked them to do then they did it. There were no grades or anything. We figured putting it on the internet, that they would want everything to look as professional as possible if they were going to put it on the internet for everyone to see it. A lot of them really took advantage of that, making sure that they had us edit it and check for issues. So we worked really hard in that respect.

(PELI staff)

Faculty and staff identified the cultural awareness and exchange piece built into their courses, and described the impact this exchange had on participants, and the mutual learning that goes on between Americans and Pakistanis, as reflected in the comments below.

I think I assumed they could make better connections if I could address what they know and what they do and what they believe. So they saw a connection between what I was advocating and that the framework they see the world in and the justifications for doing things already exists in their culture and religion. So instead of trying to westernize them I put things into their context as much as I could. Then I gave them new information and some of their responses were like 'all religions have the same purpose.' I mean these are devout Muslims and they're talking like this, 'We're all citizens, we're all related'.

(PELI staff)

I want to talk about the cultural experience...it was unbelievable. For people who meet the Pakistanis, they come with preconceived notions, it knocks down barriers, so it's important to keep the program going for that reason. Getting off the plane they [Pakistanis] were so nervous and they said

you were so nice and took good care of us... it works both ways....what they believe about America and what we believe about Pakistan depends on the media, and that can be skewed. (PELI staff)

PELI faculty also described ways in which *they* benefited from being part of the institute.

I think for us as faculty, it's a wonderful way for me to understand a whole different culture and people who are truly motivated as they are to support an educational system we can't imagine and how fortunate we are [to be] in America.... (PELI staff)

Faculty/Staff suggestions

PELI staff and faculty believed that the institute was generally successful and had been both stimulating and informative for members of the 2012 cohort. They did offer a number of suggestions to strengthen the institute *including the following*:

- Share syllabi in an easily-accessible on-line format, so that PELI faculty know what is being covered in other courses
- Schedule classes in flexible spaces conducive to small group work and intimate enough for a group of 20
- Consider having more planning meetings for all PELI faculty and staff, to promote integration of coursework and the Master Action Plans
- Strongly encourage faculty to attend the Pakistanis' final MAP presentations at PSU
- Encourage faculty to attend some of the MAP sessions, and to be flexible in offering guidance/feedback to the participants
- Consider adding a co-director for the institute with extensive background in education and teacher professional development to assist the project director
- Make sure that technology---blog, software, websites, cameras, etc., are set up and available before the institute, and that approval for their use has been secured from the university

Discussion and Recommendations:

Discussion

Our data show that the Pakistani Educational Leadership Project in general, and PELI in particular have continued to provide opportunities for engaged, motivated educators to learn about American pedagogical practices, with a focus on activity-based learning. The student-centered approaches modeled by PELI faculty have influenced Pakistani educators' teaching, and in many cases, their work with both colleagues and students.

The project continues to promote cross-cultural understanding by facilitating positive interactions between Americans and PELI participants, and has resulted in great changes in the Pakistanis' perceptions of Americans and their way of life. Almost without exception the Pakistani participants discussed their positive interactions with Americans, and expressed their appreciation for their American hosts and the commitment and interest demonstrated by PELI faculty and staff.

While a majority of the 2012 cohort has implemented all or most of their MAPs by March 2013, several discussed the difficult realities of carrying out their action plans in their communities. Some could not use their video cameras (or had to use them in limited ways) due to cultural norms and security issues. Several alumni faced significant resistance from administrators and/or community members, and had to scale back or eliminate portions of their action plans due to resistance or security concerns. This was particularly true for some female teachers in remote/tribal areas.

Our evaluation focused primarily on participants' experiences at PSU, which were quite positive. However, some participants expressed frustration about the difficulty of dealing with Hunerkada, the cooperating agency in Pakistan. They found the logistics of getting information from Hunerkada staff somewhat difficult, and wanted more effective in-country support. Many alumni did cite their ongoing interactions with the project director and other PELI staff as very helpful in providing encouragement and useful advice as they implemented their MAPs.

Recommendations

Based on staff and alumni feedback, and the evaluators' analysis of the data, we offer the following:

- Include more alumni in pre-departure orientation and the pre-departure process
- Try to involve more faculty in the MAP sessions, and have a special time to enable participants to present their MAPs to PELI faculty
- Try to schedule the institute so that Pakistani educators can view American schools in regular (non-summer) sessions
- Make sure that technology and software programs are in place before the institute, and that the blog or website are user-friendly and appropriate for participants' needs
- Make sure that MAP requirements are realistic for the cultural context of participants' schools—i.e. some cannot use video cameras to film their students
- Continue to bring faculty together before the institute, and make sure all have a clear idea of what is covered within the various courses offered at PELI.
- Provide more effective in country support to current alumni

Appendices

Appendix A: Fall 2012 participant interview protocol

Appendix B: Winter 2013 participant interview protocol

Appendix C: Focus Group protocol – 2012 cohort

Appendix D: PELI 2012 faculty protocol

Appendix A: Fall 2012 participant interview

Fall 2012

Name:

Location:

Date:

- 1) Please tell me about how things have been going since you came back from PSU. What have you done in terms of following up on your work there?
- 2) Please tell me about your action plan. How (if at all) has it changed since you left PSU?
[may be partially answered by #1]
- 3) What support, if any, have you received in Pakistan to carry out your plan?
 - a. Have you had any contact with Hunerkadastaff? [please explain]
 - **Did you attend the mid-MAP session in Islamabad?**
 - **(IF yes)** --- Was the session helpful?
How?
 - b. Have you made changes to your MAP based on the mid-MAP session or feedback from Hunerkada or PSU staff?
 - c. Have you had contact with Blake or PSU professors/PSU staff including Kathleen Smith?

Have they provided support or advice?
Please describe:
 - d. Have you received support from your colleagues, co-workers, or supervisors in carrying out your MAP?
Please explain:
- 4) How much contact have you had with other PELI alumni? Have you discussed your action plan with them?
- 5) What will you be doing next in implementing your plan?
- 6) What challenges have you faced/do you foresee in carrying out your plan?

How do you plan to deal with those challenges?

Now I'm going to ask you some questions about your experience at Plymouth:

7) What was most helpful/useful from your experience at the institute?

8) What would you have changed about PELI or done differently?

Suggestions:

9) How, if at all, has your experience at Plymouth State affected your own work in Pakistan?

Has your experience at PSU influenced your work—how you work with your colleagues, those you train, your own work with students, etc?

10) Did you interact with Americans informally?

What, if anything, surprised you about those interactions?

11) How, if at all, did your perceptions of the US and Americans change overall?

12) Is there anything else you'd like to tell us?

Appendix B: Winter 2013 participant interview

PELI 2012 Follow up interview

February 2013

Name:

Date:

Phone:

1) Please tell me about what you've done to implement your action plan since we last fall:
[Refer to what they told us last time—what has been done since?]

2) What (if any) ongoing support have you received to carry out your plan?

Probe: Did you get seed money?

Other support/contact from Hunerkada?

From Kathleen, Blake, others at PSU?

3) How have your colleagues responded to your plan/your work?

Probe: supervisors, teachers, etc

4) What challenges have you faced in carrying out your MAP?

What about admin support?

5) What has gone well/what have you accomplished?

6) Have you completed your plan? If not, what remains to be done?

Probe: How will you evaluate your plan/measure its' success?

7) Do you plan to continue your MAP, or related work **beyond** this spring?

8) What effect—if any—will your plan and PELI experience have on your future work in Pakistan?

Probe: Are you doing anything differently based on your MAP experience and your

time at PSU?

- 9) Have you had ongoing contact with other PELI alumni?
Are these contacts important to you? Why or why not?
Probe: Are you likely to stay connected?

Appendix C: PELI 2012 faculty protocol

September 2012

1) Please tell me about your summer course, and how things went this year.

Probe: Were you involved in creation of their Master plans?

2) What were the biggest challenges/constraints you faced in the course?

Probe: Specific examples of challenges and how they were resolved

3) Did anything about the group surprise you, and if so, what?

4) How did this group compare to previous groups?

Probe: How much initiative did participants take in your class?

5) How, if at all, did you tailor the course content to the Pakistanis? What did you do to make examples relevant to participants' context in Pakistan?

6) What assumptions did you make in that process? Based on what you know now, is there anything you would have done differently?

Probe: How did you deal with participants' concerns about applying this in the 'real world' context of Pakistan? (school closings, huge classes, limited resources, etc)

7) Did you plan your course content in conjunction with the other professors or did you work independently? Please tell me about the planning process:

8) How did you assess the Pakistanis' learning in your course?

9) Is there anything else you would like to tell me?